

## MINUTES - WORKFORCE COMMITTEE

|               |                                   |               |                                      |
|---------------|-----------------------------------|---------------|--------------------------------------|
| <b>Date:</b>  | Wednesday 26 June 2019            | <b>Time:</b>  | 11:00 – 12:30                        |
| <b>Venue:</b> | Conference Room, Field House, BRI | <b>Chair:</b> | Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director |

|                       |   |
|-----------------------|---|
| <b>Present:</b>       | <p><b>Non-Executive Directors:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU)</li> <li>- Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP)</li> <li>- Mr Amjad Pervez, Non-Executive Director (AM)</li> </ul> <p><b>Executive Directors:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC)</li> <li>- Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD)</li> <li>- Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer (BG)</li> </ul> |
| <b>In Attendance:</b> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Dr Maxwell Mclean, Chairman (MM)</li> <li>- Mrs Cindy Fedell, Chief Digital &amp; Information Officer (CF) for agenda item W.6.19.8</li> <li>- Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Corporate Governance (JM)</li> </ul>   |

| No.      | Agenda Item  | ACTIONS |
|----------|--|---------|
|          | <p><b>Chair's remarks</b></p> <p>SU noted the sad passing of Lorraine Cameron, Director of Equality &amp; Diversity in June. She praised the work that Lorraine had done over the years at the Trust and said she will be sadly missed by all her colleagues. All members of the Committee echoed the sentiments expressed.</p>  |         |
| W.6.19.1 | <p><b>Apologies for Absence</b></p> <p>Tanya Claridge, Director of Governance &amp; Corporate Affairs (for agenda item W.6.19.12). It was noted that JM would represent TC.</p>  |         |
| W.6.19.2 | <p><b>Declarations of Interest</b></p> <p>There were no interests declared.</p>  |         |
| W.6.19.3 | <p><b>Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 29 May 2019</b></p> <p>The minutes were accepted as a correct record.</p>   |         |
| W.6.19.4 | <p><b>Matters Arising</b></p> <p>The Committee confirmed that the actions identified as completed on the action log were now closed. The following updates with regard to the open actions were noted.</p> <p><b>W.3.19.17 – Committee Review:</b> Board Committee reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance &amp; Corporate Affairs. The Committee commented on the need to ensure the review take account of any impending CQC inspection and also ensure that all Board members were provided with an opportunity to fully participate in the review. An</p> | TC      |

| No. | Agenda Item  | ACTIONS |
|-----|--|---------|
|     | update to be provided to the August Workforce Committee meeting. |         |

|                   |  |              |
|-------------------|--|--------------|
| <b>W.6.19.4.1</b> | <b>Matters Arising from the Board of Directors</b><br><br>There were no matters arising.   |              |
| <b>W.6.19.4.2</b> | <b>Matters Escalated from the Sub Committee</b><br><br>PC raised the issue of the Consultants Pension Tax in relation to the implications of the Annual Allowance and the Lifetime Allowance for consultant medical staff. The IGRC had suggested that the Workforce Committee should be sighted on any potential risks. PC stated that the risks were potentially in relation to Consultants who may wish to reduce PA's, who weren't taking up leadership roles and who may be reducing premium rate activity. PC advised that following the IGRC meeting, this issue was discussed at the Education & Workforce Committee meeting on 21 June 2019 where it was noted that at this point in time the CBU's haven't raised any risks in terms of their risk registers. PC advised that she and David Craske, Chair of the LNC, are undertaking a survey to gain a true indication of our Consultant workforce's intentions over the next 12 months. SU requested that an update is brought back to the September meeting.   | PC           |
| <b>W.6.19.5</b>   | <b>Strategic Risks relevant to the Committee</b><br><br>SU drew attention to the risks specific to this Committee as highlighted within the document and all agreed to remain sighted on the risks during discussions.<br><br>It was agreed at the last meeting to revise the KPI's which are updated on the BAF. PC confirmed that all KPI's would be picked up through the Committee dashboard. PC asked the Committee to note that she has updated the assurance section of the BAF with regard to notice of industrial action in relation to the Wholly Owned Subsidiary. The Committee discussed in detail the actions in place to mitigate the risk.<br><br>It was agreed at the last meeting that a recommendation would be presented to the July Board of Directors indicating a green assurance rating. The Committee discussed in detail whether the green rating should remain due to the imminent industrial action in relation to the WOS. Following further detailed discussion the Committee agreed that a recommendation for a green rating would be made to Board recognising that a detailed discussion with Board was required in light of the industrial action proposed.<br><br>PC further advised that the WOS was a risk on the Strategic Risk Register but had not been pulled through to show on the SRR relevant to the Workforce Committee. She further advised that she would discuss with TC what was to be included within the paper to be presented to the Board in light of the discussion held with regard to the green rating. | SU<br><br>PC |

|                        |  |           |
|------------------------|--|-----------|
| <p><b>W.6.19.6</b></p> | <p><b>Workforce Committee Dashboard</b></p> <p>The Committee discussed the dashboard in detail. The following key themes were noted:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <u>Appraisal Rates:</u> PC reported that performance rates are at 90.5% compared to 72% in the previous year. The Senior Leadership Team (SLT) was asked to consider if the appraisal season is still the best approach as there has been a representation from the Care Groups to reconsider the concept of an appraisal season and, to retain the 95% target by the end of December. PC advised that this had been discussed at Senior Leadership Team (SLT) meeting and also at Education &amp; Workforce Committee meeting and agreed with a re-review next year. PC added that the SLT was conscious of the new pay progression rules coming in under Agenda for Change. PC agreed to retain monthly reporting to the Committee. She further advised that monitoring will be undertaken at Care Group level in terms of appraisal performance and any areas of concern will be escalated. The Committee also noted that intervention work is ongoing in hot spot areas which is working well and improvements are being made.</li> <li>• <u>Staff Friends and Family:</u> Despite improvement in the Trust's results in Q4 we are still benchmarking lower than other Trusts in Yorkshire &amp; Humber. Whilst we are behind Yorkshire &amp; Humber in terms of peers we have narrowed the gap considerably re place to work. In Q2 &amp; Q4 we had a 10% gap which has now reduced to 2%. The benchmark for the percentage of staff who would recommend our Trust as a place to be treated has not seen any narrowing of the gap. The results have stayed static against our peers. PC agreed to look at what could be driving these results and report back to the Committee in August.</li> <li>• <u>Sickness:</u> Sickness absence is showing a slight month on month increase particularly in short term sickness. There is a downturn on long term sickness. PC stated that a positive outcome since the move to the CBU structure is that a lot of managers have come to HR with ideas on how to reduce sickness absence.</li> </ul> <p>The Committee noted that there were no other areas of concern on the dashboard.</p> | <p>PC</p> |
| <p><b>W.6.19.7</b></p> | <p><b>Informatics Strategy Presentation</b></p> <p>SU introduced the session and welcomed CF to the meeting.</p> <p>CF provided an overview of the digital strategy which she stated fundamentally impacts on staff skills and the early adoption of innovation. The Committee discussed in detail and noted the following key points.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Most staff are technologically literate and are in possession of at least one device.</li> <li>• The top of the list for digital impact in terms of workforce is the use of genome data for personalised care-based treatments to identify patients to plan treatment in advance before a disease manifests.</li> <li>• The biggest impact will be on administrative staff teams.</li> <li>• There will be advantages, challenges and complexities going forward.</li> </ul>   |           |

|  |   |    |
|--|---|----|
|  | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Topol Review is aimed at preparing the workforce for the digital future and has 3 recommendations which CF discussed.</li> <li>The NHS Long Term Plan workforce implementation group will convene to address the Topol recommendations with a high level workplan expected in 2019/20.</li> <li>The skills increasingly required are digital know-how.</li> </ul> <p>JP asked CF if there were any literacy issues amongst staff particularly portering staff with regard to inputting information directly onto a digital device. CF reported that it was nursing staff aged 50+ that were the least confident inputting information even though they were all now trained and using EPR.</p> <p>The Committee expressed their thanks to CF for the insightful presentation.</p> <p>The Committee also noted the range of areas impacted by the Digital Strategy and agreed that a question should be raised at Board regarding which Committee should be the assuring Committee.</p> | SU |
|--|---|----|

|                 |  |    |
|-----------------|--|----|
| <b>W.6.19.8</b> | <p><b>Nurse Staffing Data Publication Reports – May 2019</b></p> <p>KD presented the paper and asked the Committee to note:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The fill rates are consistently the same each month and have stabilised over the last 6 months with fewer fluctuations.</li> <li>There were 15 Datix incidents during May 2019 with a number of these related to nursing and midwifery staffing on inpatient areas. Work is ongoing with maternity staffing and the Maternity Incentive Scheme. Midwives are being actively encouraged to incident report when the staffing levels are not what they should be. Update on progress was presented to the May Quality Committee and will be presented at the July Board of Directors. SU queried the 10 incidents in Maternity which related to lower number of midwives than planned due to short term sickness, long term sickness and maternity leave. KD reiterated that there were several reasons for this ranging from short term sickness, maternity leave and three clinical midwives that are on non-clinical duties which all has an impact. To mitigate the risk we have a hot desk midwife who is available 24/7. The maternity theatres and the maternity assessment centre are now staffed 24/7.</li> <li>The use of the Safecare tool to support decision making through the availability of patient acuity and dependency data is now established as an integral part of the safety huddles by the matrons and is used by the Clinical Site Teams out of hours.</li> <li>The maternity staffing review update will be presented to the Board in July 2019.</li> <li>Heat Map - It was agreed at the last Workforce Committee to change some of the red areas to blue. This was further discussed at the Quality Committee who did not approve these changes therefore the RAG rating</li> </ul> | KD |
|-----------------|--|----|

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
|                  | <p>remains the same. KD agreed to discuss with CF a way to adapt and improve the dashboard to also include headers on all pages.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ward Accreditation – MM queried the red ratings of 3 wards and the process undertaken to rectify this. KD said that the wards met with her to discuss the results and action plans are developed which are robustly checked by the Matron and Head of Nursing. KD agreed to meet with MM to review the accreditation documents. SU queried if early intervention can be put in place to anticipate that a ward rating will change to red due to staffing issues, high numbers of falls or pressure ulcers. KD noted that one of the early interventions is to bring the accreditation visit forward using the accreditation tool to determine a baseline. There is a whole suite of measures in place to ensure a systematic approach to sustain wards.</li> </ul> <p>The Committee noted the report.</p> |    |
| <b>W.6.19.9</b>  | <p><b>7 Day Service Board Assurance Framework Annual Report</b></p> <p>BG provided a comprehensive overview of the paper. Overall there are 4 Clinical Standards as referred to in the paper. Standards 5, 6 &amp; 8 were achieved at well above the 90% target. Standard 2 we haven't achieved the 90% standard although it was noted that the national standard for Acute Trusts is in the region of 60% and the Trust has achieved 87%. Importantly, in the two major admitting areas of general surgery and general medicine we achieved the 100% target. The bulk of our patients are being seen within 14 hours by a consultant. The areas that have not achieved 100% are those areas where there is less intensity; therefore the pattern of work is different. The Trust is hoping to introduce a system to remotely review patients using EPR. BG agreed to bring back a full report to the Workforce Committee in September.</p> <p>The committee noted the report.</p>    | BG |
| <b>W.6.19.10</b> | <p><b>Guardian of Safe Working Hours Annual Report</b></p> <p>BG noted the Board Development Session last month which Andy Brennan had presented so he didn't intent to go through the report in any detail. BG drew attention to the graph on page 5 which shows when there is a peak in exception reporting the interventions put in place are changing the profiles very quickly. BG asked the Committee to note that issues are discussed at the Junior Doctor's Forum to try and resolve in a timely manner.</p> <p>The Committee requested that BG pass on their sincere thanks to Andrew Brennan, Guardian of Safe Working Hours/Consultant Anaesthetist for the work he has done as the Guardian of Safe Working Hours.</p>   |    |
| <b>W.6.19.11</b> | <p><b>Annual Report on Medical Appraisal and Revalidation 2018-19</b></p> <p>BG presented the paper which summarises our 12 months period April to March for Medical Appraisal and Revalidation and licence to practice. The Trust consistently delivers at over 95% target against the national benchmark for acute trusts of 88%.</p> <p>The Committee noted the paper.</p>   |    |

|                  |   |    |
|------------------|---|----|
| <b>W.6.19.12</b> | <b>Internal Audit Plan</b><br><br>The Committee noted the plan and agreed to think about future audits to add to the 2020/21 plan.<br><br>PC queried the purpose of the audit related to E-Rostering and Junior Doctors and AHPs - on page 8 of the report as this implementation has only just started. JM agreed to discuss the timing with Internal Audit.<br><br>The Committee noted the plan.  | JM |
| <b>W.6.19.13</b> | <b>Board Assurance Framework</b><br><br>SU asked if the Committee was satisfied the necessary controls and mitigations were in place to cover the areas of concerns that have been highlighted and discussed at the meeting. The Committee felt confident that progress was being made across a range of key workforce indicators and that they had received evidence demonstrating tangible assurance.   |    |
| <b>W.6.19.14</b> | <b>Confirmed minutes of the Education and Workforce Sub Committee – April 2019</b><br><br>The Committee accepted and noted the minutes from the meeting of the Education and Workforce Sub-Committee held on 12 April 2019.   |    |
| <b>W.6.19.15</b> | <b>Any Other Business</b><br><br><b>Wholly Owned Subsidiary (WOS)</b><br><br>PC advised that the Trust has been notified of a week of industrial action starting Monday, 8 <sup>th</sup> July starting at 6am for 7 days, 24 hours a day ending on the Monday, 15 <sup>th</sup> July at 6am. Meetings have taken place with the Trust Executive and the Unions and separately with MP's. The Trust has been informed that the only thing that will avert the strike is if the Board changes its decision and doesn't proceed with the WOS or at a very minimum agrees to a pause until after a general election. An Industrial Action Operational Group is in motion and has been in process for a couple of weeks to organise the operational plans to cover the week of industrial action. There may be some impact on elective capacity but that is still being worked through. Unison have agreed to meet and agree essential cover arrangements. John Holden, Acting Chief Executive, is taking the lead on communications. Yesterday a position statement was circulated to external stakeholders along with a global email to all staff. PC reminded the Committee that, as stated previously in the meeting, the WOS was a risk on the Strategic Risk Register but wasn't showing on the SRR relevant to the Workforce Committee.<br><br><i>Post meeting note: ID 3350 – WOS -The risk of service disruption resulting from Trade Unions balloting – Risk score 9 – Assuring Committee is Major Projects Committee. PC agreed to discuss with Matthew Horner, Director of Finance</i> | PC |

|                  |  |                      |
|------------------|--|----------------------|
| <b>W.6.19.16</b> | <b>Matters to share with other Committees</b><br><br>The Internal Audit Plan query would be shared with the AAC.   | JM                   |
| <b>W.6.19.17</b> | <b>Matters to Escalate to the Strategic Risk Register</b><br><br>There were no matters to escalate   |                      |
| <b>W.6.19.18</b> | <b>Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors</b><br><br>The Committee referenced the discussion that had taken place in relation to the presentation delivered by CF on the Digital Strategy given the range of areas impacted by the Strategy. The Committee agreed that a question should be raised at Board on which Committee should be the assuring Committee.  | SU                   |
| <b>W.6.19.19</b> | <b>Items for Corporate Communications</b><br><br>There were no matters to escalate   |                      |
| <b>W.6.19.20</b> | <b>Agenda items for the Workforce Committee scheduled 24 July 2019</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Education Team is now available to deliver a tour of the Simulation Centre. This item to be added to the July agenda.</li> <li>The Interim People Plan to be added to the July agenda.</li> <li>Presentation to the August meeting to be added: Amanda Hudson &amp; Jo Hilton to talk about changes to nurse training and the work ongoing with Bolton and Bradford Universities to increase our pre-registration students.</li> <li>7 Day service update – to be removed from July agenda and deferred to the September meeting.</li> </ul> | JM<br>PC<br>KD<br>BG |
| <b>W.6.19.21</b> | <b>Date and time of next meeting</b><br><br>24 July 11:00-13:00  |                      |





Bradford Teaching Hospitals  
NHS Foundation Trust

**BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST**  
**ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – June 2019**

| Date of Meeting | Agenda Item | Required Action  | Lead   | Timescale                           | Comments/Progress   |
|-----------------|-------------|--|--|-------------------------------------|---|
| 29.5.19         | W.5.19.12   | <b>Board Assurance Framework</b><br>The Committee agreed to make a proposal to the Board of a green RAG rating in the highlight report.  | Workforce Committee Chair                    | Board of Directors<br>11 July 2019  | Added to July Board agenda –<br><u>Action closed</u>                                    |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.5    | <b>Strategic Risks relevant to the Committee</b><br>PC to discuss with TC the content of the paper to Board on 11 July re Industrial action  | Director of HR                               | Board of Directors<br>11 July 2019  | <u>Action closed</u>  |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.8    | <b>Nurse Staffing Data Publication</b><br>Maternity Staffing Review updated to be presented to Board in July   | Chief Nurse                                  | Board of Directors<br>11 July 2019  | Added to July Board agenda –<br><u>Action closed</u>                                    |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.18   | <b>Matters to escalate to the Board of Directors</b><br>Question to be raised at Board on which Committee should be the assuring committee for the Digital Strategy  | Workforce Committee Chair                    | Board of Directors<br>11 July 2019  | Added to July Board agenda –<br><u>Action closed</u>                                    |
| 24.4.19         | W.4.19.14   | <b>BAF: Proposed Board Development Session</b><br>A discussion took place regarding Communications and the role it could better play in supporting the celebration of the culture of the organisation. AP stated that it was essential to ensure that every piece of work is aligned back to the Trust's vision and strategic objectives. SU suggested it might be useful to explore the delivery of a Board development session with regard to the communications strategy. | Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs | Board of Directors<br>11 July 2019  | Proposal added to the October Board Development session Agenda.<br><u>Action closed</u> |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.20   | <b>Agenda items for the Workforce Committee 24 July agenda</b><br>Simulation Centre to be added to July agenda   | Head of Corporate Governance                 | Workforce Committee<br>24 July 2019 | Added to July Workforce agenda –<br><u>Action closed</u>                                |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.20   | <b>Agenda items for the Workforce Committee 24 July agenda</b>   | Director of HR                               | Workforce Committee                 | Added to July Workforce agenda –<br><u>Action closed</u>                                |



| Date of Meeting | Agenda Item | Required Action  | Lead                         | Timescale                             | Comments/Progress   |
|-----------------|-------------|--|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|---|
|                 |             | Interim People Plan to be added to July agenda   |                              | 24 July 2019                          |   |
| 26.6.19         | W.6.19.15   | <b>AOB – Wholly Owned Subsidiary</b><br>PC to discuss with MH about adding Workforce Committee as an assuring committee for the WOS risk ID 3350   | Director of HR               | Workforce Committee<br>24 July 2019   | Risk reviewed – <u>Action closed</u>  |
| 29.5.19         | W.5.19.19   | <b>Agenda items for 26 June 2019 meeting</b><br>Strategic Objective 4 to be added to the June agenda for discussion  | Workforce Committee Chair    | Workforce Committee<br>24 July 2019   | Item deferred from May to June Quality Committee therefore discussion at Workforce Committee deferred to July. Added to July agenda- <u>action closed</u>   |
| 27.02.19        | W.2.19.9    | <b>Workforce Report</b> - Workforce Dashboard to reflect any changes in the metrics and measures and align with the BAF from April 2019.   | Director of HR               | Workforce Committee<br>24 July 2019   | 29.5.19 – Committee agreed to change the timescale to July due to updates awaited from IT on dashboards.  |
| 27.03.19        | W.3.19.17   | <b>Committee Review</b><br>The following should be noted and form part of the review.<br><ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The necessity of having monthly meetings of the Workforce Committee</li> <li>- The disproportionate level of detail contained within papers for monthly meetings – given the level of update provided.</li> <li>- If meetings remain monthly - should consideration be given to holding one longer meeting, then one shorter meeting the following month?</li> <li>- Committee might also like to consider holding quarterly transactional meetings and then have a 'subject-based' approach for additional monthly meetings.</li> </ul> | Head of Corporate Governance | Workforce Committee<br>28 August 2019 | 26.6.19 – Board committee reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance & CA. Verbal update to be provided to August meeting<br><br>New Chair in post early May. <u>Update to Committee 29 May 2019</u> : Date for all Board Committee Reviews being considered by the Chair and Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs. Committee to note that further update will be provided to Workforce Committee in June 2019. |

| Date of Meeting    | Agenda Item                        | Required Action  | Lead                         | Timescale                                | Comments/Progress                                   |
|--------------------|------------------------------------|--|------------------------------|--|---|
|                    |                                    | - Committee would benefit from wider membership. It would be beneficial for deputies to attend and present particular items<br>These points would be shared with the Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs and the BTHFT Chair to support the review when it takes place. |                              |  |   |
| 26.6.19            | W.6.19.6                           | <b>Workforce Committee Dashboard</b><br>Staff Friends and Family – PC agreed to look into what is driving these results  | Director of HR               | Workforce Committee<br>28 August 2019    |   |
| 26.6.19            | W.6.19.12<br>W.6.19.16             | <b>Internal Audit Plan</b><br>JM agreed to discuss the timings of the E-Rostering and Junior Doctors audit as implementation had just begun.   | Head of Corporate Governance | Workforce Committee<br>28 August 2019    | To be discussed at the AAC meeting on 30 July 2019. |
| 26.6.19            | W.6.19.20                          | <b>Agenda items</b><br>Changes to nurse training and work with Bolton and Bradford Universities presentation to be added to August agenda.   | Chief Nurse                  | Workforce Committee<br>25 September 2019 | Deferred to September from August                   |
| 30.1.19<br>26.6.19 | W.1.19.13<br>W.6.19.9<br>W.6.19.20 | <b>Update on Seven Day Service Performance against Clinical Standards for 2018</b><br>BG stated that following the completion of the audit a report will be provided to the Committee.   | Chief Medical Officer        | Workforce Committee<br>25 September 2019 | 26.6.19 - Agreed to be deferred to September.       |
| 29.5.19            | W.5.19.19                          | <b>Agenda items for Workforce</b><br>SU suggested inviting a local Trust to present on their friends and family data at a future Workforce Committee. PC agreed to look into this  | Director of HR               | Workforce Committee<br>25 September 2019 |   |
| 26.6.19            | W.6.19.4.2                         | <b>Matters escalated from the sub committee</b><br>Consultant Pension Tax – update back to September meeting   | Director of HR               | Workforce Committee<br>25 September 2019 |   |



Bradford Teaching Hospitals

NHS Foundation Trust

| Date of Meeting | Agenda Item | Required Action  | Lead                  | Timescale                                | Comments/Progress |
|-----------------|-------------|--|-----------------------|--|-------------------|
| 30.1.19         | W.1.19.7    | <b>Workforce Committee Annual Work Programme: Development Sessions</b><br>BG agreed to bring a presentation on next year's Clinical Excellence Awards (CEAs) to the Workforce Committee meeting in September 2019. | Chief Medical Officer | Workforce Committee<br>25 September 2019 |                   |